

ARIZONA DEPARTMENT OF CHILD SAFETY

Review of Reporting Requirements

Report Consolidation (December 2017)

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Introduction

Pursuant to Laws 2017, First Regular Session, Chapter 282, Section 6, the Department of Child Safety (Department) is required to submit a report to the Joint Legislative Budget Committee (JLBC) and the Joint Legislative Oversight Committee (JLOC) on the Department of Child Safety that addresses the implementation of a new reporting structure and the outcome of stakeholder meetings, and to post the proposed consolidated report generated from the recommendations by December 31, 2017 on the Department's website.

The Department currently has 39 unique reports that result in 84 total reports being submitted throughout the year (i.e. monthly, quarterly, semi-annual and annual reports). This does not include ad hoc reports, data submission to federal agencies, Children's Medical and Dental Plan reports or data submissions to the Arizona Health Care Cost Containment System (AHCCCS) or special requests for data and information.

Stakeholder Meetings

The Department and Community Members have been meeting since the summer of 2016 and began meeting quarterly in CY2017 to share and discuss child welfare outcome metric and other measurements involving the child welfare system. The Department and stakeholders are committed to continuing these meetings and outcome metric discussions in 2018.

Stakeholder involvement included representatives from the Maricopa County Juvenile Court, the Governor's Office of Strategic Planning and Budgeting (OSPB), Arizona State University (ASU), Casey Family Program, child advocates, human service providers, foster parents, foster care licensing agencies, regional behavioral health authorities, and AHCCCS. Stakeholder meetings in 2017 were conducted in January, March, June, July, along with multiple meetings in August, September, October and December.

In 2016, as a result of the ongoing stakeholder meetings/recommendations, the Department enhanced a metric worksheet it had developed to include numerous additional metrics recommended by stakeholders. This worksheet has been posted to the Department's website on a monthly basis since January 2017 (https://dcs.az.gov/DCS-Dashboard).

All considerations for continuing, modifying or omitting data metrics from these reports was discussed at length in the stakeholder meetings, and written recommendations were also provided on an ongoing basis. Stakeholders and the Department agreed that the vast majority of these

Review of DCS Reporting Requirements (December 2017)

measures and metrics should continue and/or be combined into one consolidated report wherever possible to reduce duplicative reporting of data in multiple reports (see Attachment A).

RECOMMENDATIONS

Consolidation Efforts

Consolidate the Semi-Annual Child Welfare Reporting Requirements, Semi-Annual Financial and Program Accountability Report and the Quarterly Progress Report on Reducing the Backlog and Filling FTE Position into a single semi-annual report containing the required elements of each unless recommended for omission. It is recommended that the reporting periods for these reports change to January through June and July through December to align with the state fiscal year.

Consolidate the Kinship Foster Care Report, the Independent Living Annual Report, and the Housing Assistance Report into a single annual report entitled Permanency Support Services Annual Report.

Continue to maintain and post online the Department's enhanced metric worksheet developed to include numerous additional measures and metrics recommended by stakeholders, the monthly staffing report and the monthly financial report. In consultation with stakeholders, DCS will consider including the outcome measures that have been historically reported to the Legislative DCS Oversight Committee.

Stakeholder Recommendations and Requests

Numerous recommendations and requests were made for modifications and additions to the Department's data reporting requirements. Additionally, there were recommendations to eliminate a select few items. The proposed changes include, but are not limited to, the following:

- For data on substantiation rates, the Department should report on a data lag of 12 months to allow for completion of due process and the appeals process, and avoid reporting incomplete data.
- Expand the demographics data on children in care to compare age, race, ethnicity by placement type, region/county, exit reason, and length of time care.
- Separate licensed foster homes into two categories to track how many licensed homes are kinship placements compared to non-kinship placements.
- Report caseload data on theh county and/or regional level rather than by office.
- For the Kinship Report, show the amount spent per services by licensed kinship and unlicensed kinship.
- Eliminate redundancy in reporting employee hiring and attrition by removing Specialist and Supervisor data from the Semi-Annual Accountability Report and leaving it ONLY in the Monthly Staffing Report and consolidating that with the Monthly Data Report.
- Continue the *Title XIX Behavioral Health Financial & Accountability Report* (herein after referred to as "*Title XIX Accountability Report*") and consolidate this with the Semi-Annual report.

Stakeholders also provided recommendations with which the Department did not agree, are still under consideration or are already being met by another agency. Key among these include, but are not limited to:

Behavioral health data

- Rapid Response referrals and appointments data This is maintained by AHCCCS who is already tracking this data on the AHCCCS dashboard for CMDP enrolled youth..
- Data on whether a referral for service was made at assessment, and whether it occurred within established timeframes This data is maintained in part by AHCCCS. Limitations on how specific services referrals are made are kept as a data point prevent the execution of this recommendation. However, timeliness to service is being tracked on the AHCCCS dashboard for CMDP enrolled youth.
- Parent attendance at Child and Family Team meetings AHCCCS acknowledges the importance of parents' attendance at the CFT meeting but does not currently have a mechanism in place that enables the tracking of this metric.
- Penetration rate for all Medicaid enrolled children v. Medicaid enrolled children in foster care - AHCCCS publishes a CMDP dashboard with penetration rates calculated by each RBHA.
- Behavioral health expenditures The Department does not object to continuing the Title XIX Behavior Health Program and Financial Accountability Report but would recommend it be consolidated into the Semi-Annual report rather than on a quarterly basis.
- Placement disruptions due to behavioral health concerns This was initially raised as a
 metric to track. However, as the discussion on this progressed, stakeholders recognized
 the challenges to tracking this as a data element although the stakeholder workgroup and
 the Department agree to prioritize this as part of the ongoing stakeholder/Department
 meetings.
- Data on one specific Axis I mental health diagnosis A stakeholder recommended this data be added. As a group, stakeholders did not see value in reporting one specific diagnosis but after discussions with AHCCCS, they agreed to assess the capability of reporting the top three diagnoses for CMDP enrolled children.

Office of Child Welfare Investigations (OCWI)

- Some stakeholders requested that the Department report on the number and percent of OCWI involved investigations resulting in criminal prosecution and convictions. However, this would involve the solicitation and collection of data from each of the fifteen County Attorney's offices involving investigations that the Department/OCWI would potentially have closed several years prior. Additional concerns, addressed in the full report, complicated this request further.
- Stakeholders requested that the Department compare results of Department investigation to OCWI investigations. However, starting August 2017, OCWI assumed full responsibility for investigation of Department cases in which a criminal conduct code is assigned.

Review of DCS Reporting Requirements (December 2017)

PAGE LEFT INTENTIONALLY BLANK



ARIZONA DEPARTMENT OF CHILD SAFETY

Review of Reporting Requirements

Report Consolidation (December 2017)

Introduction

Pursuant to Laws 2017, First Regular Session, Chapter 282, Section 6, the Department of Child Safety (Department) is required to submit a report to the Joint Legislative Budget Committee (JLBC) and the Joint Legislative Oversight Committee (JLOC) on the Department of Child Safety that addresses the implementation of the new reporting structure, the outcome of stakeholder meetings, and the identification of new metrics. In addition, the Department is required to post the proposed consolidated report generated from the recommendations required by Laws 2014, Second Special Session, Chapter 1, Section 160 on the Department's website by December 31, 2017.

STAKEHOLDER MEETINGS AND NEW REPORTING STRUCTURE

Stakeholder Meetings

The Department and Community Members ("stakeholders") have been meeting since the summer of 2016 and began meeting quarterly in CY2017 to share and discuss child welfare outcome metrics and other measures involving the child welfare system. The Department and stakeholders are committed to continuing these meetings and outcome metric discussions in 2018. The overarching theme that drove all collaboration was to identify metrics that can better measure outcomes for children and families, in order for the Department to assess and identify areas of success, opportunities for improvement, and targets for continuous improvement. Additionally, outcome measures will help stakeholders assess provision and adequacy of services. The Department is committed to maintaining a continuous formal conversation between the Department and stakeholders to identify any metrics that are needed to help better inform the Department's policies and practices. Additionally, the group intends to continue to discuss metrics that would also inform stakeholders' sound business practices and enhance service provision.

Stakeholder involvement included representatives from the Maricopa County Juvenile Court, the Governor's Office of Strategic Planning and Budgeting (OSPB), Arizona State University (ASU), Casey Family Program, child advocates, human service providers, foster parents, foster care licensing agencies, regional behavioral health authorities, and the Arizona Health Care Cost Containment System (AHCCCS). Stakeholder meetings in 2017 were conducted in January, March, June, and July, with multiple meetings were held in August, September, October and December.

The report consolidation work group provided recommendations in 2016 regarding modifications to currently required data metrics (Laws 2014, 2nd Special Session, Chapter 1, Section 160). While the intent was always to continue the ongoing meetings with stakeholders, SB1003 resulted in an increase in the more frequent meetings in order to develop the report to the JLBC. This report was a continuation of conversations during the 2016 work group.

The Department currently produces 39 unique reports that result in 84 total reports being submitted throughout the year (i.e. monthly, quarterly, semi-annual and annual reports). This does not include ad hoc reports, data submission to federal agencies, Children's Medical and Dental Plan reports, data submissions to AHCCCS or special requests for data and information.

In 2016, as a result of the ongoing stakeholder meetings/recommendations, the Department enhanced a metric worksheet it developed to include numerous additional metrics recommended by stakeholders. This is named the *DCS Monthly Report* and is posted to the Department's website on a monthly basis (https://dcs.az.gov/DCS-Dashboard). This document combined several metrics identified by Department leadership and several identified by stakeholders. It also includes the Monthly Staffing Report and Monthly Financial Report data as well. Ultimately, it would be recommended that the *Monthly Staffing Report* (currently required pursuant to Laws 2016 Chapter 117, Section 24) and the *Monthly Financial Report* (currently required pursuant to Laws 2017, 1st Regular Session, Chapter 305), not be required as individual reports but be consolidated with the *DCS Monthly Report* as is currently being done in a proposed format.

All considerations for continuing, modifying or omitting data metrics from these reports were discussed at length in meetings and written recommendations were also provided by stakeholders on an ongoing basis. There are more than 150 data metrics within the Department's major reports. Stakeholders and the Department agreed the vast majority of these should continue and/or be combined into one consolidated report wherever possible to reduce duplicative data reporting (see Attachment A). **Therefore, the summary of stakeholder comments will highlight only those metrics where significant changes were recommended or discussed, or new metrics requested**. The recommendations are organized to align with the Department's three major reports; *Semi-Annual Child Welfare Reporting Requirements*, *Semi-Annual Financial and Program Accountability Report* and the *Quarterly Progress Report on Reducing the Backlog and Filling FTE Position*.

Several stakeholders discussed the importance of data on kinship providers and the services they are provided or to which they have access. Primarily, existing metrics in the bi-annual Kinship Report and Semi-Annual Child Welfare Reporting Requirements should include the amount of monies spent on various services. Additionally, stakeholders would like to see licensed foster homes broken out to show how many kinship placements are licensed. While this is possible, it is also a labor-intensive project for the Department, thus reporting this in the consolidated Semi-Annual report was amenable to stakeholders.

Consolidation Efforts

In order to streamline the Department's reporting structure, the stakeholder work group made recommendations for consolidating the Department's major reports. These include the Semi-

Annual Child Welfare Reporting Requirements (herein after referred to as 'Child Welfare Report'), Semi-Annual Financial and Program Accountability Report (herein after referred to as "Accountability Report") and the Quarterly Progress Report on Reducing the Backlog and Filling FTE Position (herein after referred to as "Quarterly Progress Report"). There are many agency reports that include same or similar data in multiple reports. It was the hope to reduce redundancy and improve consistency in the data reported.

In addition to the proposed *DCS Monthly Report*, the Department is recommending that several of its major reports be consolidated and reporting periods change to align all reports with the state fiscal year (SFY). The following is a summary of those recommendations.

- Consolidate the *Child Welfare Report*, *Accountability Report* and the *Quarterly Progress Report* into a single semi-annual report (*Semi-Annual Consolidated Report*) containing the required elements of each unless recommended for omission. While the majority of the data elements in these reports would be consolidated into a single semi-annual report, a select few data elements, which are outlined in *Attachment A*, would only be reported in the *DCS Monthly Report* spreadsheet to reduce redundancy. Additionally, the Department recommends that the *Title XIX Accountability Report* be consolidated with this semi-annual report only if its statutory requirement is extended beyond December 31, 2018.
- Change the reporting periods for the semi-annual report to January through June and July through December. This would allow stakeholders using the data to plot on SFY and/or calendar year (CY) depending on their need. The new due dates are recommended to remain consistent with the existing standard for the *Child Welfare Report* which allows the Department three months to collect, validate and review the large volume of data pulled for these reports. Therefore, the new due dates would be March 31st and September 30th.
- The Department attempted to structure a sample of this new consolidated report in spreadsheet format similar to the *DCS Monthly Report*. However, given the sheer volume of data points and the varying levels of categorization required, the result was a very cumbersome product that was neither user friendly nor intuitive. Therefore, the Department and majority of stakeholders agreed that the new format would include tabled data with minimal to no graphics and limited narrative. There were stakeholders who desired the graphics remain. Reducing narrative and graphics would serve several purposes:
 - Stakeholders can easily transpose data for their own use just as they are currently doing with the *DCS Monthly Report*;
 - o Given the sheer volume, this will help reduce the opportunity for errors; and
 - This style presents the data in a format closer to the format of the *DCS Monthly Report*.
- Narrative would still be included to provide details in the executive summary when necessary. The narrative would be included to align the summary with identified and strategic initiatives established during a given reporting period. Narrative would also be included to provide clarification needed to better explain, define and understand certain data points (e.g. defining response times for the four priorities assigned to a report of abuse and/or neglect). Otherwise, the Department and stakeholders agreed to reduce as much narrative as possible to avoid restatement of data already presented in the tables.

The Department also recommends additional consolidation efforts of several individual annual reports.

- Consolidate the Kinship Foster Care Report (herein after referred to as "Kinship Report"), the Independent Living Annual Report (herein after referred to as "IL Report"), and the Housing Assistance Report (herein after referred to as "Housing Report"), into a single annual report entitled Permanency Support Services Annual Report. This recommendation is supported by the notion that all of these services support permanency for youth.
- Stakeholders requested that costs associated with kinship placement be included. This would include, but not be limited to, grandparent stipend, clothing allowance, and maintenance costs. While some of this is reported on an aggregate level in the DCS Monthly Financial Report, stakeholders recommend breaking this cost out in the proposed Permanency Support Services Annual Report.
- The Kinship Foster Care Report is currently required bi-annually (every two years). The Department and stakeholders agree with changing this to an annual requirement if consolidated with the other reports. Additionally, stakeholders requested that the proposed *Permanency Support Services Annual Report* delineate data on licensed and unlicensed families separately.

Stakeholder Recommendations and Requests

The following is a detailed list of various metrics identified by stakeholders as recommended for modification, addition or omission and the Department's response to each recommendation. These recommendations were reviewed by stakeholders during CY 2016 and CY 2017.

Reporting Periods

- Report all semi-annual data based on SFY rather than Federal Fiscal Year (FFY) unless required.
 - *The Department concurs.*
- Should consolidation be approved for a semi-annual consolidated report, the first report would be due on September 30, 2018 to cover the fourth quarter of SFY 2018 (April through June 2018) in order to align the new reporting period. All subsequent reports would then be due March 31st covering July through December and due September 30th covering January through June.
 - *The Department concurs.*

Investigations

- Substantiated reports recommend report on a data lag of 12 months to allow for the completion of due process and the appeals process, and avoid reporting incomplete data.
 - *The Department concurs.*
- Unsubstantiated reports recommend report on a data lag of 12 months to allow for the completion of due process and the appeals process, and avoid reporting incomplete data.
 - *The Department concurs.*
- Reports proposed for substantiation recommend report on a data lag of 12 months to allow for the completion of due process and the appeals process, and avoid reporting incomplete data.
 - *The Department concurs.*

- Stakeholders requested data be included that would denote how many communications the Hotline received that have been screened out as a report due to A.R.S. § 8-544 made in 2016.
 - Stakeholders were in agreement with the Department providing this data to the workgroup for a limited period upon request but that it should not be required in statute.

Permanency

- Currently, the A.R.S. § 8-526(15)(e) requires the Department to report "the median, average and range of the number of out-of-home placements" for children in out-of-home care on the last day of the reporting period. Significant discussion was held with stakeholders discussing "placement stability".
 - Initial discussion focused on counting placement disruptions due to "behavioral health reasons." It was ultimately determined that rate of placement change, regardless of reason, was the most important focus as an outcome metric to assess placement stability. Therefore, the Department and stakeholders agreed that the Department should be required to "report on the stability of placements for children in OOH care" However, the Department and stakeholders should have flexibility to define the particular metric or metrics reported and analyzed.
- Expand the demographic data about children in care to compare the ages, races, and ethnicities of children by placement type, region/county, exit reason, and length of time care. While these demographics are reported already in the *DCS Monthly Report*, new outcome metrics on length of time in care and placement stability is being considered for outcome metrics. Additionally, stakeholders want to show the age, race, and ethnicity of children by placement type and length of time in these settings.
 - The Department concurs to explore feasibility of reporting this data semi-annually, but cautions that continued and congoing discussion with stakeholders is essential to understanding the proper use of data on children in care on a specific day (point-in-time) and data on children who enter care during a period (entry cohort data).

Licensed Foster Homes and Kinship Care

- When reporting on the number of licensed foster homes, identify how many are kinship/relative placements.
 - The Department has noted that there are challenges to breaking out licensed foster homes that are also considered a 'relative placement' as they may have a child placed as a kinship placement but also a non-relative child placed with them. This could double enumerate them as both a kinship placement and a licensed placement. There are also system limitations that prevent the Department from doing this any more often than on a semi-annually or annually basis.
 - Reporting on newly licensed and closed foster homes is already captured in the DCS Monthly Report. However, to break out how many licensed foster homes are also considered relative placements would only be reported as part of a Semi-Annual Consolidated Report.
- As noted previously, stakeholders requested that costs associated with kinship placement (e.g. grandparent stipend, clothing allowance, maintenance costs, etc.) be broken out by

licensed and unlicensed kinship caregivers. Additionally they recommend that the actual costs be included in reporting structure, not just a listing of the services.

- The Department concurs with this recommendation but only as part of a consolidated Permanency Support Services Annual Report.
- Stakeholders recommended that Kinship Foster Care include expanded data on the volume of services available and provided to kinship caregivers.
 - While the Department has agreed to research this, it must acknowledge there are a variety of challenges. Among other things, some services listed are not always provided directly by the Department. For example, transportation may be provided by the RBHA for a child's behavioral health services. Department case management services is not billable and thus not quantifiable. However, the Department will continue its commitment to exploring the viability of providing more detailed information on the volume of services provided to kinship caregivers broken out by licensed and unlicensed homes.
- Stakeholders recommend the Department ensure that the cost of services provided to unlicensed kinship foster care families is compared to the cost of licensed and that recommendations regarding program improvement are included in the kinship report as required already by A.R.S. § 8-514.03. This is currently in the existing report (see pages 3 and 7 of the 2016 Kinship Foster Care Program Report).

Caseloads

- The Department and stakeholders discussed current caseload metrics. It was generally agreed that comparing the number of cases or reports per Department Specialist (caseload) does not fully measure whether Department Specialists have the right amount of time to successfully manage their cases (workload). Many factors impact reasonable caseload and workload levels, including but not limited to, case complexity, geophysical location of families, documentation requirements, availability of support staff, and service capacities.
 - The Department will consider process and outcome measures that can inform management about whether case workloads are reasonable. Measuring whether essential case management tasks are completed on time and with sufficient quality can demonstrate if Department Specialists are effectively managing their cases, and therefore whether their workload is reasonable. Measuring timely case plan development, monthly contacts with children and parents, etc. is a more meaningful way of determining if staff have manageable workloads.
- Stakeholders want to ensure the Department continue to report supervisor to specialist ratio in the semi-annual report.
 - The Department concurs with this recommendation and will include it in the Semi-Annual Consolidated Report.
- Stakeholders recommended omitting reporting the 'number of cases that remain open' since that is intuitive given the number of new cases and cases that have been closed. Moreover, the Department reports, and stakeholders prefer, knowing how many reports are received and how many children are in out-of-home or involved in in-home cases.
 - The Department concurs with continuing reporting of new and closed cases and concurs with omitting the report of 'cases that remain open'.

- Caseload data should be reported on a Regional level. Reporting at the office or sectional level becomes cumbersome and does not inform overall accountability. Stakeholders requested that caseload data be included at the county level. Some stakeholders requested this information be reported monthly.
 - The Department concurs with this recommendation to report by Region and supports reporting this semi-annually but broken out by month so trends can be monitored.
 - The Department notes there are challenges to reporting this monthly as children in out-of-home care is a lagging metric and calculating caseloads is labor intensive to complete on a monthly basis.
- In-Home caseload counts should be based on number of children rather than number of cases.
 - The Department concurs with this recommendation and is currently seeking to validate methodologies that will improve the reliability of data for children in inhome cases.

EMPLOYEE RETENTION & TRAINING

- Employee turnover, including a breakdown of employees who remain with the Department and employees who leave the Department.
 - *The Department has added rolling 12-month retention/turnover rate in the* DCS Monthly Report.
- Employee Satisfaction rating for Department employees recommend using the annual Arizona Department of Administration employee survey in place of this metric.
 - The Department concurs with this recommendation as this reduces duplicative and similar surveys conducted internally and externally. It will also align with the statewide effort to focus on engagement rather than an overall 'satisfaction' rating.
- Employee Satisfaction rating for employees completing the Department training academy
 recommend omitting this metric, as it does not provide a meaningful evaluation of training curriculum or field readiness.
 - The Department concurs with this recommendation and with reporting the outcomes of the Child Welfare Training Institute post-training assessment semi-annually, which determines if Specialist develop skills in training that are applied to the field.
- Employee turnover recommend adding voluntary attrition to turnover data
 - The Department concurs with this recommendation and is already reporting this in the monthly staffing report. It is further recommended that the monthly staffing report not be a standalone report but incorporated into the DCS Monthly Report.
- For the Percent of Office of Administrative Hearings where Department case findings are affirmed, it was recommended reporting annually to align with substantiation metric reporting.
 - *The Department concurs with this recommendation.*
- The Monthly Staffing Report should be reported as part of the *DCS Monthly Report* rather than a stand-alone report.

¹ Starting in August 2017, OCWI assumed full responsibility for investigation of DCS cases in which a criminal conduct code is assigned. All investigation data for OCWI will be reported as its own Region.

• The Department concurs with this recommendation. It should consider whether it is helpful to report all FTE positions monthly or if the non-Specialist positions data can be summarized in the semi-annual consolidated report.

FINANCIAL

- Expenditures for services allowed under the federal IV-E waiver recommend omitting this metric, as it was put in place to report the waiver that expired in 2008. Relevant updates to the current IV-E waiver will be provided in the federally required semi-annual reports.
 - The Department concurs with this recommendation and is already providing a semi-annual report updating the efforts made to implement and sustain waiver activity.
- Monthly Financial Report (aka 30th of the Month) should be part of the *DCS Monthly Report*. The due date should be changed to the 'last day of the month'.
 - *The Department concurs with this recommendation.*

OTHER

- Percent of Department complaints reviewed by the Office of the Ombudsman Citizen Aide
 where allegations are reported as valid by the Ombudsman recommend that this metric
 be reported by the Office of the Ombudsman Citizen's Aide.
 - The Department concurs with this recommendation to omit this from DCS reporting.
- If the *DCS Monthly Report* becomes statutorily required, it is recommended that the due date be the last day of the month for data for the prior month (except when data lag applies). The report should highlight any metric that would be a lagging metric.
 - *The Department concurs with this recommendation.*

Additionally, recommendations were made for the *DCS Monthly Report*. While these were considered for future development, not all were immediately incorporated due to administrative and technical reasons.

- Add a Year End Goal column to populate items where this would be appropriate or possible.
 - The Department does not agree with this recommendation. Information related to the Agency's goals are already reported in the Annual Strategic Plan (Strategic Plan).
- Include "Aging Out" or "Reaching Age of Majority" to "Exit by Permanency Type". Additionally, stakeholders requested that the children's actual ages be included for those over 18 when they exit care.
 - The Department concurs with this recommendation and has already implemented this in the DCS Monthly Report. However, the Department must explore the feasibility of adding another layer of metric given the monthly number is typically a small number and it is uncertain what value will be added to the including this metric.
- The Northern Arizona University (NAU) audit should be referenced or included in Preventative Services on the *DCS Monthly Report*.

- The Department does not agree with this recommendation as the Department is still assessing the most efficient and accurate means by which to report prevention services.
- Add a line in "Licensed Foster Care Capacity" section to show homes "closed due to adoption/guardianship".
 - The Department concurs with this recommendation and has already implemented it.

ADDITIONAL RECOMMENDATIONS

The following metrics were identified by stakeholders as being recommended for consideration in future reporting structures. These include references to the metrics that the original report consolidation legislation (Laws 2014, 2nd Special Session, Chapter 1, Section 160) requires be considered.

BEHAVIORAL HEALTH

Representatives from AHCCCS were included in the 2017 meetings to consider behavioral health data. What became evident is that data requested by stakeholders was not owned by the Department. The recommendations are included below including any issues identified by AHCCCS.

- Rapid Response referrals and appointments made;
 - This data is currently being tracked by AHCCCS and the RBHAs and is incorporated into the AHCCCS CMDP Dashboard.
- Behavioral Assessments completed versus referred;
 - The number of children referred for a rapid response assessment versus those completed is currently being tracked. Referrals for assessments through mechanisms other than the rapid response are more difficult to track since they can be made through multiple routes and parties.
- Was a referral service made at assessment? If so, did the service occur? If so, was it timely (21 days)?
 - AHCCCS is in the process of standardizing the medical record review across RBHAs to consistently evaluate and report on these metrics. AHCCCS is currently tracking the time from CMDP enrollment to the first behavioral health service as well as the timeframe between an assessment and the first behavioral health service.
- Did parent(s) attend CFT and/or services;
 - This data is captured in the behavioral health provider's medical record. The capability to measure and report on this metric will be evaluated by AHCCCS.
- Continue the Title XIX Behavioral Health Financial & Accountability Report.
 - The Department would concur with this recommendation but recommends it become part of the Semi-Annual Consolidate Report.
- Behavioral health expenditures and Penetration rate for Medicaid enrolled children v. Medicaid enrolled children in foster care;
 - AHCCCS publishes a CMDP dashboard with penetration rates calculated by each RBHA. AHCCCS is currently standardizing the definition of penetration rate

across the system including Medicaid enrolled children in foster care and will be updating the dashboard with these metrics once finalized.

- Placement disruptions due to behavioral health concerns;
 - As noted previously, stakeholders now agree with the work group examining this issue on an ongoing basis but requiring the Department to report on placement stability.
- Data on timeliness of services should be weighed against meaningful services (i.e. if a case management service was delivered timely, is that truly meaningful to assess whether a child in need received a service that would directly benefit their behavioral health needs)
- While stakeholders understand the challenges reporting psychotropic medication data, stakeholders would like to review existing reports and continue discussing with AHCCCS the viability of reporting this metric on a semi-annual or annual basis. AHCCCS currently is reporting this data every other year with the next report scheduled to be released in 2018.
- A recommendation was discussed to provide specific for mental health diagnosis.
 - Stakeholders did not see value in reporting one specific diagnosis. However, stakeholders did agree that reporting the three most common diagnoses for CMDP enrolled children was of value. AHCCCS agreed they have the capability to provide this data.

OFFICE OF CHILD WELFARE INVESTIGATIONS

- The number and percent of OCWI involved investigations that resulted in criminal prosecution and convictions.
 - The Department notes this would involve having to obtain data from each of the fifteen County Attorney's offices for data on investigations that OCWI would potentially have closed out several years prior. Additionally, the arrest and/or conviction is dependent on many other variable factors outside the Department's control. It is not certain that an OCWI involved investigation would lead to an arrest and/or conviction. An alternative approach might be to conduct case reviews in the future. Additionally, OCWI is not a prosecutorial agency.
- Compare results of DCS investigation to OCWI investigations.
 - o Starting August 2017, OCWI assumed full responsibility for investigation of DCS cases in which a criminal conduct code is assigned
- Under current law, the Department must report joint investigation data independently from the county attorneys. County attorney information is currently displayed on Arizona Prosecuting Attorney Advisory Council (APAAC) website although there is no requirement that APAAC does so. Select stakeholders recommended that the Department website also display the county attorney reports and/or link to the specific APAAC website page that has these reports.

COHORT DATA

• The workgroup began an extensive review of the Office of Quality Improvement's draft/proposed outcome metrics. This effort was tabled in the Fall of 2017 while the work group worked on developing this report; however, the work group intends to continue its review on an ongoing basis.

ATTACHMENT

Review of DCS Reporting Requirements (December 2017)

■ Attachment A contains the exact language of A.R.S. § 526 (Child Welfare; reporting requirements), A.R.S. § 8-818 (Child safety services; financial and program accountability), and Laws 2016, 2nd Regular Session, Chapter 8, Section 24 (Quarterly progress report on reducing the backlog and filling FTE), A.R.S. § 8-514.03(H) (kinship foster care; requirements; investigation; report), A.R.S. § 8-462(E) (housing assistance), and A.R.S. § 8-521(J)(K) (independent living program; conditions; eligibility; rules; case management unit; reports). For each element, the recommendation whether to omit, modify or consolidate is identified and to which consolidated report it would be housed.



ARIZONA DEPARTMENT OF CHILD SAFETY

Review of Reporting Requirements Attachment A

Table of Contents

Definitions	2
ARS § 8-526 - Semi-Annual Child Welfare Reporting Requirements	2
A.R.S. § 8-818 - Semi-Annual Financial and Program Accountability Report	10
Laws 2016, 2nd Regular Session, Chapter 8, Section 24 - Quarterly Progress Report on Reducing the Backlog and Filling FTE.	12
Kinship Foster Care Program Biannual Report	16
Housing Assistance Program Annual Report	17
Independent Living Program Annual Report	18

DEFINITIONS

Consolidate – Continue reporting the metric as is currently required but combine it with one or more reports into a single report. This will reduce redundancy and the overall volume of required reports while maintaining the requirement for the Department to report the

metric.

Omit – Eliminate the requirement for the Department to report this metric.

Modification – Continue reporting the metric but modify its frequency, definition, methodology and/or condition.

SEMI-ANNUAL CHILD WELFARE REPORTING REQUIREMENTS

8-526. Child welfare; reporting requirements

The department shall compile the following information on a semiannual basis ending March 31 and September 30 of each year:

Modification: align with state fiscal year. Recommend semiannual basis end on June 30 and December 31.

1. The total number of reports received, by major category and by priority. The report shall include a description of some of those incoming communications determined not to meet the criteria of a report as chosen by a random sample.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

2. The number of reports not responded to, by priority, by county and statewide. The report shall include a description of some of these cases as chosen by random sample.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

Modification: This measure is to report on the number of reports to which the Department did not respond and the reasons why the Department did not respond on a sample of cases. However, stakeholders and the Department agree a more critical measure is the response timeliness to a report by priority and county. Therefore, the Department recommends reporting its success rate in meeting timelines which is now included in the Monthly Report.

3. The number of reports assigned for investigation by priority and by major category, by county and statewide for the current and previous reporting periods.

- 4. The number of investigations completed by priority and by major category, by county and statewide for the current and previous reporting periods and as categorized by investigations that resulted in:
 - (a) A substantiated report.

Modification: Substantiated reports – recommend a data lag of 12 months to allow for the due process and appeals process.

(b) A report currently proposed for substantiation.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

Modification: Reports proposed for substantiation – recommend data lag of 12 months to allow for the due process and appeals process.

(c) An unsubstantiated report.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

Modification: Unsubstantiated reports – recommend updating annually and to report on a data lag of 12 months to allow for the due process and appeals process.

5. The number of reports assigned for investigation that remain open for investigation by priority and by major category, by county and statewide for the current and previous reporting periods.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

6. Of the number of reports assigned for investigation, the percentage of reports that resulted in a child being placed in out-of-home care by county and statewide.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

7. The number of newborn infants delivered to safe haven providers pursuant to section 13-3623.01.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

8. The number of children entering out-of-home care by county during the reporting period, and the number and percentage of the children entering out-of-home care by county during the reporting period who are voluntary placements for children under eighteen years of age.

- 9. The number and percentage of children removed during the reporting period, by county and statewide, who had been in out-of-home care:
 - (a) Within the previous twelve months.

(b) Within the previous twenty-four months, excluding the children included in subdivision (a) of this paragraph.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

10. The number and percentage of children who have remained in a shelter or receiving home for more than twenty-one consecutive days, by the child's age group.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

11. The number and type of licensed foster homes and the number of licensed and available spaces in those homes.

Consolidation: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report and DCS Monthly Report

(Note: the Department is now reporting on the DCS Monthly Report the total number of licensed foster care beds, total licensed foster homes, new licenses issues, total licenses closed and four most populous reasons for closure.)

Modification: Stakeholders requested the Department include the number of licensed foster homes who are also identified as a kinship/relative placement. There are current challenges to breaking out licensed foster home who are also considered a 'relative placement'. A foster home may have a child placed as a kinship placement but also a have a non-relative child placed with them. This could double enumerate them as both a kinship placement and a licensed placement. To accurately break this out requires labor intensive efforts that would not be reasonable on a monthly basis. Therefore, Department would only be able to consider doing this semi-annually or annually rather than monthly.

12. The number and type of licensed foster homes that leave the foster care system and the reason for the exit.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report (the top four closure reasons are also captured on the Monthly Report)

13. The number of licensed foster homes that receive the required visitation by case managers pursuant to section 8-516.

Modification: <u>A.R.S.§ 8-516</u> refers to licensed child welfare agency's representative visiting the foster home. In order to provide clarity and eliminate confusion, the Department recommends that the above language referencing "case managers" be changed to 'licensed child welfare agency's representative'.

14. The number of children placed in the care, custody and control of the department at the end of the reporting period and the number of these children who receive the required visitation by case managers pursuant to section 8-516.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

- 15. The number and percentage of children who are in the care, custody and control of the department at the end of the reporting period and who are in out-of-home placement and as categorized by:
 - (a) Age.

Consolidate: DCS Monthly Report (OOH Demographics)

(b) Ethnicity.

Consolidate: DCS Monthly Report (OOH Demographics)

(c) Case plan goal.

Consolidate: DCS Monthly Report (OOH Demographics)

(d) Type of out-of-home placement, categorized by age.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

(e) Length of time in out-of-home placement of less than thirty days, thirty-one days to twelve consecutive months, twelve to twenty-four consecutive months and more than twenty-four consecutive months, including the median, average and range of the number of out-of-home placements.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

(f) Primary legal status including voluntary placement for a child under eighteen years of age, temporary custody, adjudicated dependent, free for adoption, voluntary placement for a child over eighteen years of age, dually adjudicated or any other legal status.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

16. If the case plan is to return the child to the parent, the percentage of parents who receive the required contact by case managers.

- 17. The number and percentage of children who left the custody of the department during the reporting period by reason for leaving care and as categorized by:
 - (a) Age.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report (make age groups consistent with monthly report which are more detailed than current semi-annual report)

(b) Ethnicity.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

(c) Number of placements.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report (recommend statutory change that will require placement stability for all children in care be reported, not just children exiting)

(d) Average length of time in care.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

18. The number of children with a petition for termination of parental rights granted and not granted during the reporting period by county and statewide.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

- 19. The number and percentage of children with a case plan goal of adoption and who are not placed in an adoptive home at the end of the reporting period and as categorized by:
 - (a) Age.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

(b) Ethnicity.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

(c) Average length of time in care.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

(d) Legal status.

- 20. The number and percentage of children with a case plan goal of adoption and who are placed in an adoptive home at the end of the reporting period and as categorized by:
 - (a) Age.

(b) Ethnicity.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

(c) Average length of time in out-of-home placement.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

(d) Length of time from change of case plan goal to adoptive placement.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

(e) Legal status.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

(f) Marital status and relationship of the adoptive parent or parents to the child.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

- 21. The number of children whose adoptive placement was disrupted during the reporting period and as categorized by:
 - (a) Age.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

(b) Ethnicity.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

(c) Cause of the disruption.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

(d) Marital status and relationship of the adoptive parent or parents to the child.

- 22. The number of children whose adoptions were finalized during the reporting period and as categorized by:
 - (a) Average length of time in out-of-home placement before adoptive placement.

(b) Average length of time in adoptive placement before the final order of adoption.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

(c) Marital status and relationship of the adoptive parent or parents to the child.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

- 23. The number of children who died while in the custody of the department by the county where the death occurred and as categorized by:
 - (a) The cause of death.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report (add definition of 'cause of death' or reference other statutory definition of 'cause of death' to be used)

(b) The type of out-of-home placement at the time of death.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

- 24. The number of children with an open or active child safety services case who died due to abuse, categorized by the person or persons who had care or custody of the child at the time of the child's death as follows:
 - (a) Biological parent or parents.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

(b) Other family member.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

(c) Adoptive parent or parents.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

(d) Foster care parent or parents.

(e) Other out-of-home care provider.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

25. The number of children with an open or active child safety services case who died due to abuse allegedly caused by an adult household member who is not listed pursuant to paragraph 24 of this subsection.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report (include this as subsection (24)(f) as 'other adult household member")

B. Based on the data presented in each reporting period, the department, in as brief a format as possible, shall describe three to five major challenges the department faces in achieving the goal of safe, permanent homes for abused and neglected children.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

C. Within three months after the end of each reporting period the department shall submit a written report in as brief a format as possible to the governor, the president of the senate, the speaker of the house of representatives, the chairperson of the house human services committee, the chairperson of the senate family services committee, or their successor committees, and the co-chairpersons of the joint legislative committee on children and family services. The department shall submit a copy of the report to the secretary of state and the director of the Arizona state library, archives and public records.

Modification: Align due dates with state fiscal year. Change the reporting periods for the semiannual report to January through June and July through December. This would allow stakeholders using the data to plot on SFY and/or calendar year (CY) depending on their need. The new due dates are recommended to remain consistent with the existing standard for the Child Welfare Report which allows the Department three months to collect, validate and review the large volume of data pulled for these reports. Therefore, the new due dates would be March 31^{st} and September 30^{th} .

SEMI-ANNUAL FINANCIAL AND PROGRAM ACCOUNTABILITY REPORT

A.R.S. § 8-818. Child safety services; financial and program accountability

- A. The department, the office of strategic planning and budgeting and the joint legislative budget committee shall develop a financial and program accountability reporting system for the department.
- B. The accountability reporting system shall include the following accountability factors:
- 1. Success in meeting training requirements.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

Omit; satisfaction rating and utilize metric measuring knowledge acquisition for CORE training (i.e. Training Academy)

2. Caseloads for child safety workers.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

3. The number of new cases, cases that remain open and cases that have been closed.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report (number of new cases and case that have been closed.)

Omit: Stakeholders and the Department agree to omit cases that remain open.

4. The ratio of child safety workers to immediate supervisors.

Consolidate –Monthly Report

5. Employee turnover, including a breakdown of employees who remain with the department and employees who leave the department.

Consolidate – DCS Monthly Report (note: this metric currently included in the Monthly Report. By consolidating, redundancy can be reduced. The Department recommends a 30-day lag to ensure data integrity.)

6. The source and use of federal monies in the department.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

7. The source and use of state monies in the department.

- 8. Any additional factor deemed necessary by the department, office and committee.
- C. The department shall issue a financial and program accountability report to the governor and the chairpersons of the house of representatives appropriations and human services committees and the senate appropriations and family services committees, or their successor committees, on or before February 1 and August 1 of each year.

Modification: align with state fiscal year and recommended changes to <u>A.R.S. §. 8-526</u>. Recommend semi-annual basis end June 30 and December 31 making the written report due September 30^{th} and March 31^{st} .

D. In developing the financial and program accountability reporting system, the department, the office of strategic planning and budgeting and the joint legislative budget committee shall review the current reporting requirements of the department to eliminate duplication of reporting requirements and to coordinate reporting requirements. The department, the office of strategic planning and budgeting and the joint legislative budget committee shall also review the current information processing capabilities to report timely and accurate information.

In addition to those elements required by A.R.S. § 8-818, the JLBC previously requested the following factors:

8. Employee satisfaction rating for employees completing the Training Academy (Scale 1-5).

Omit: duplicative of (B)(1)

9. Employee satisfaction rating for employees in the Department of Child Safety (Scale 1-5).

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

Modification: utilize ADOA employee engagement measures to reduce redundant surveying and align with statewide measures.

10. Percent of original dependency cases where Court denied or dismissed.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

11. Percent of Office of Administrative Hearing where case findings are affirmed.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report

Modification: data should only be updated annually to align with substantiation data.

12. Percent of complaints reviewed by the Office of the Ombudsman where allegations are reported as valid by the Ombudsman.

Omit: Recommend this metric be reported by the Office of the Ombudsman Citizen's Aide.

13. The number of children in licensed foster care, kinship care, or other family-style placements.

Consolidate: Monthly Report

QUARTERLY PROGRESS REPORT ON REDUCING THE BACKLOG AND FILLING FTE

Laws 2016, 2nd Regular Session, Chapter 8, Section 24

1. Progress made in increasing the number of filled FTE positions,

Consolidate: Monthly Report

- 2. Progress reducing the number of backlog cases
 - a. Number of backlog cases

Consolidate: Monthly Report

b. number of backlog cases by disposition

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report (report two figures-one for last day of each quarter)

c. number of backlog cases in the investigation phase

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report (report two figures-one for last day of each quarter)

d. number of backlog cases associated with out-of-home placements

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report (report two figures-one for last day of each quarter)

e. number of backlog cases associated with in-home cases.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report (report two figures-one for last day of each quarter)

- 3. Progress reducing out-of-home children.
 - a. number of out-of-home children

Consolidate: Monthly Report

- 4. Progress made meeting the caseload standard
 - a. Caseworker workload on March 31, 2016 in comparison to the latest quarter

Omit

b. Total number of open reports

Consolidate: Monthly Report

- 5. To determine the caseworker workload, the department shall report
 - a. the number of case-carrying caseworkers at each field office; and

Consolidate: Semi-Annual Consolidated Report (change requirement to report at the field office level to reporting Regional and County data only); (report six data sets; one for each month)

b. the number of investigations, in-home cases, and out-of-home children assigned to each field office.

Consolidate: Semi-Annual (change requirement to report at the field office level to reporting Regional and County data only); (change in-home count from cases to children); (report six data sets; one for each month)

6. The quarterly report shall provide the same information on the total number of filled FTE positions as is required by the monthly hiring report.

Consolidate: Monthly Report

- 7. For backlog cases, the department's quarterly benchmarks are as follows:
 - a. 10,000 cases as of September 30, 2016;

Omit (benchmark was met)

b. 7,000 cases as of December 31, 2016;

Omit (benchmark was met)

c. 4,000 cases as of March 31, 2017; and

Omit (benchmark was met)

d. fewer than 1,000 cases as of June 30, 2017 and thereafter.

Consolidate: DCS Monthly Report

- 8. For open reports, the department's benchmark is:
 - a. fewer than 13,000 open reports as of June 30, 2017 and thereafter.

Consolidate: DCS Monthly Report

9. For out-of-home children, the department's benchmark is to reduce the number of children in out-of-home care by an average of an additional 2.0 percent every quarter with respect to the out-of-home care population as of December 31, 2016.

Omit (the existing statute only requires the Department to reach this target by June 30, 2018. Currently the Department is on track to achieve that goal as the OOH population for SFY 2018, Quarter 2 is at 15,744 with the 2% reduction goal being 16,142. The 2 percent reduction benchmark for June 30, 2018 will be 15,503. Therefore, the Department recommends that this benchmark be omitted after June 30, 2018 provided it has achieved the reduction below 15,503)

- 10. It is the intent of the legislature that the out-of-home care population be:
 - a. below 17,500; and

Omit (benchmark was met in SFY 2017, Quarter 3 when the OOH population was 17,174)

b. the cumulative reduction as compared to the population as of December 31, 2016 be 11.4 percent on or before June 30, 2018.

Omit (The Department recommends that this benchmark be omitted after June 30, 2018 provided it has achieved the benchmark.)

KINSHIP FOSTER CARE PROGRAM BIANNUAL REPORT

8-514.03(H). Kinship foster care; requirements; investigation; report

H. The department of child safety shall evaluate biannually the performance of the kinship foster care program. On or before November 1, the department shall submit a report to the speaker of the house of representatives, the president of the senate and the governor and shall provide a copy of this report to the secretary of state. The report shall contain the following information:

1. The demographics and number of children placed with relative caregivers.

Consolidate: Permanency Support Services Annual Report

2. The demographics of kinship foster caregivers.

Consolidate: Permanency Support Services Annual Report

3. The number of relative children per kinship foster care family.

Consolidate: Permanency Support Services Annual Report

4. The department's success at maintaining kinship foster care placements.

Consolidate: Permanency Support Services Annual Report

5. The type of services provided to kinship foster care families.

Modification: consolidate into the Permanency Support Services Annual Report but recommended to aggregate cost of each service to the extent possible (e.g. case management is a non-billable DCS service, or transportation may be provided by a RBHA for a child's behavior health services and thus not included in DCS expenses).

6. The cost of services provided to kinship foster care families compared to the cost of out-of-home placements.

Consolidate: Permanency Support Services Annual Report (Note: this is a comparison of the average monthly cost for children placed in kinship foster care to the average monthly cost for children in family foster care.

7. Recommendations regarding program improvement.

Consolidate: Permanency Support Services Annual Report

HOUSING ASSISTANCE PROGRAM ANNUAL REPORT

8-462(E). Housing assistance

E. The department shall make the following information regarding the housing assistance program available to the public on request and on the department's web site:

1. The number of children and families, by district, receiving services through this program during the previous fiscal year.

Consolidate: Permanency Support Services Annual Report

2. The total amount of monies spent on the program by district.

Consolidate: Permanency Support Services Annual Report

3. A programmatic and fiscal evaluation of the effectiveness of this program which includes the amount of monies saved by reducing foster care expenditures.

Consolidate: Permanency Support Services Annual Report

INDEPENDENT LIVING PROGRAM ANNUAL REPORT

8-521(J)(K). Independent living program; conditions; eligibility; rules; case management unit; reports

- J. The department shall prepare a report on or before March 1 of each year that contains the following information for the previous calendar year:
 - 1. The number of children in the program.

Consolidate: Permanency Support Services Annual Report

2. The number of children in the program by age and grade.

Consolidate: Permanency Support Services Annual Report

3. The number of children in the program by county of residence.

Consolidate: Permanency Support Services Annual Report

4. The number of children in the program who graduated from high school.

Consolidate: Permanency Support Services Annual Report

5. The number of children in the program who received a general equivalency diploma.

Consolidate: Permanency Support Services Annual Report

6. The number of children in the program enrolled in postsecondary education.

Consolidate: Permanency Support Services Annual Report

K. The department shall submit a copy of the report prescribed in subsection J of this section to the governor, the president of the senate, the speaker of the house of representatives and the secretary of state.